National Science Challenges

BUILDING BETTER HOMES, TOWNS AND CITIES

Ko ngā wā kāinga hei whakamāhorahora

The attraction, integration, and retention of newcomers in regional settlements

Summary Literature Review & Annotated Bibliography

Building Better Homes, Towns & Cities: Thriving Regions
Client Report Number: RE450/2020/013
February 2020

Jude Wilson[1], Mike Mackay[2], Harvey Perkins[3], Nick Taylor[4] & Malcolm Campbell[5]

1. Jude Wilson Research Consultancy
2. AgResearch Limited
3. The University of Auckland
4. Nick Taylor and Associates
5. The University of Canterbury

agresearch
āta mātai, mātai whetū

Contents

1. General Introduction 1

2. Summary Literature Review 2

2.1 The goal of ‘integration’ 2

2.2 Differentiating immigrants 3

2.3 Acceptance within the host community 4

2.4 The community context 6

2.5 Housing 7

3. Conclusion: Welcoming Communities 8

4. References and Annotations 9

5. Acknowledgements 30

1. General Introduction

This annotated bibliography and summary literature review was prepared in support of the Thriving Regions (South Island) research theme of the Building Better Homes, Towns and Cities National Science Challenge: Ko ngā wā kāinga hei whakamāhorahora. Thriving Regions comprises a set of integrated cases studies of South Island regions, settlements and communities that are attempting to create positive futures for themselves. Researchers are working directly with community stakeholders as they navigate change, determine their own aspirations, confront impediments to wellbeing and search for solutions to local problems, while enacting sustainable future pathways. The aim of the research is to reveal what practical approaches are most effective at creating real-world change in different community, settlement and regional settings, and to document examples where residents, local governments, community groups, and businesses have collaborated to create change.

During Phase I of the Challenge's regional settlements research, we had an active and effective engagement with the Councils and communities of Timaru, Ashburton and Waitaki Districts. The emphasis was on place-based, locally established initiatives to regenerate environmental, social, cultural and economic elements of regional settlements. In Phase II we are building on work in Timaru and Oamaru where we have developed strong research participant networks and a culture of meaningful and effective engagement. We are also extending the programme (in Phase II) by adding Cromwell and Marlborough as case study sites and by shifting the emphasis of our questions from an interest in a wide range of local initiatives to a small, more focused, group of activities.

One focus of this new work is on the active strategic thinking about the future of work, housing and associated cultural issues in regional settlements. This is the particular emphasis of our work in Oamaru and to an extent, Timaru. One of our key questions is 'how well are newcomers, particularly workers and their families, positioned in terms of (access to) work, affordable housing and culturally appropriate services?'

This annotated bibliography reviews a set of international literature directed at helping the research team and research participants to answer this question. The material reviewed was broadly focused on rural community transformation and on a range of issues associated with the attraction, integration and retention of immigrants in rural communities.The bibliography therefore presents a review of material on a range of topics associated with immigrant populations and their attraction to and retention in (mainly) rural areas and small towns, including: acculturation; refugee relocation and settlement; labour migrants; the provision of community support services; immigrant organisations; immigrant and immigration discourse; rural housing; rural community transformation and revitalisation; and community resilience. The material reviewed represented a mix of conceptual and empirical research articles. In addition, several more applied research reports were reviewed.

The summary literature review which follows is structured around themes relating to the successful integration of immigrants in rural communities. These include:

- The goal of 'integration'

- Differentiating immigrants by resettlement purpose, ethnicity and demographic characteristics
- Acceptance within the host community
- The community context
- Housing
- 'Welcoming communities'

2. Summary Literature Review

2.1 The goal of 'integration'

Although the majority of papers identify immigrant 'integration' as a primary goal for communities, the actuality/reality of integration is not always explicit. Nayar (2015), for example, notes that immigrants can be categorised according to four acculturative strategies – integration, marginalisation, separation or assimilation – all of which may occur at different times. It is suggested that attitudes toward the absorption of immigrants has changed from a quest for integration to hosting a 'mosaic' of cultures, a goal supported by the definition of integration provided by Coakley and Éinri (2016, p.101): "Integration means the ability to participate to the extent that a person needs and wishes in all of the major components of society, without having to relinquish his or her own cultural identity" (Department of Justice, Equality and Law Reform, 1999).

Sibley and Ward's (2013) 'multiculturalism' is similarly described, in that it supports the "maintenance of heritage cultures across diverse ethnic and cultural groups" while also promoting "intergroup contact" and equitable participation in the wider society" (p.700). Coakley and Éinri (2016), however, note that 'intercultural' represents a qualitatively different approach to that implied by 'multicultural' (i.e., the former promotes active engagement between groups, while the latter simply recognises and supports ethnic variations). Coakley and Éinri (2016), however, admit that this viewpoint implies a more reductionist conceptualisation of multicultural than is commonly understood.

In their paper on the 'global rural' Nelson and Nelson (2010) reflect on the intersection and interaction of multiple migrant and immigrant groups in the rural community, both with the long term resident community and with each other. The focus in the majority of papers addressing integration is on the migrant/immigrant – rather than the resident community – experience, with immigrants differentiated according to a number of criteria. Several authors note the heterogeneity of 'immigrant' populations (Brown, 2017; Berg-Nordlie, 2018; Depner & Teixeira, 2012; Coakley & Éinri, 2016, Nelson & Nelson, 2010) with some authors focusing on the characteristics of immigrants as factors impacting on integration success (e.g., Brown, 2017) and others on their acceptance in the community (e.g., Berg-Nordlie, 2018).

The terms migrant or newcomer can include a range of possibilities (see next section). There is a tendency to think of these people as coming primarily from other countries with the terms 'migrant' and 'immigrant' often applied generically and interchangeably. In our research, newcomers include all those people who come from beyond the boundaries of the regions under study. They may include migrants from within the country, and immigrants from outside the country. Motives for migration may also vary.

Some are temporary (often overseas) labour migrants and others relocate with the intention of permanent settlement, attracted by employment opportunities and/or opportunities for career advancement. In many countries, refugees and asylum seekers – whose migration is driven by push rather than pull factors – represent a significant portion of new immigrants. Another group (amenity migrants) migrate to consume the amenity of their new home region. Their movement may be temporary, cyclical or permanent. Some of these migrants may be retirees. We are interested in all of these groups but in this bibliography, the emphasis is on overseas immigrants.

2.2 Differentiating immigrants

Based on their (re)settlement motives or purpose, a range of immigrant types can be identified in the literature. Some papers/studies address a single type of immigrant while others conflate multiple immigrant groups or provide comparative data across immigrant types. The following broad categories of immigrant are commonly differentiated:

- asylum seekers/refugees and labour migrants (Coakley & Éinri, 2016)
- lifestyle, entrepreneurial and labour migrants, and refugees (McAreavey & Argent, 2018)
- family, economic and refugee immigrant classes (Brown, 2017)
- a transience continuum which includes new migrants and different types of labour migrants (Wilson & Simmons, 2018)
- sub-hierarchies in migrant secondary labour markets (Rye & Scott, 2018)

Ethnicity remains a key descriptor of immigrant 'difference' and has been identified as having a significant influence on integration in the community (Colic-Peisker, 2019; Rye & Scott, 2018; van Kooy et al., 2019; Woods, 2018a). Ethnicity broadly encompasses race (often referred to in terms of skin colour), language and religion as well as being used to describe cultural distance (between immigrants and the host community) (Rye & Scott, 2018). While homogeneity within individual immigrant groups is commonly assumed, religious fragmentation even within immigrant groups with same belief systems is reported (Wilson & Simmons, 2018).

There can be significant differences between immigrant groups and the host communities' social practices and leisure interests (Wilson & Simmons, 2018) and poor understanding of the ways in which migrants navigate social structures has been reported (Rye & Scott, 2018). Rye and Scott (2018) describe this social and cultural distance as 'an identity frontier'. Woods (2018a) suggests that immigrant participation in community social activities is constrained by cost, working schedules and lack of transport, and is impacted by uncertainty around permanence in the community and also by accommodation limitations.

Refugees and labour migrants are the two key immigrant types to attract research attention, with the majority of studies reflecting immigration changes common to specific countries or regions (e.g., the study of refugee migration in Australia and labour migration in Europe and North America). Refugee research is sometimes framed within the context of regional labour and population renewal strategies (e.g., Broadbent et al. (2007) in Australia; Esses & Carter (2019) in Canada). Some studies focus on the immigration of a predominant nationality/ethnic group (e.g., Montayre, et al.'s (2017)

study of Filipino migrants in New Zealand and Woods' (2018b) study of Chinese migrants in Australia). The considerable body of research on refugees in Australia has primarily focused on refugee experience, and the identification of structural policy measures necessary to support the refugee population, rather than integration initiatives fostered within the host community (Colic-Peisker, 2009; Hebbani & Khawaja, 2019; McAreavey & Argent, 2018). Refugees have been shown to need more support than other migrants (Colic-Peisker, 2009) especially in respect to finding employment (Hebbani & Khawaja, 2019; van Kooy et al., 2019).

Globally, structural agricultural transformations coupled with rural population decline have led to increases in labour migration (McAreavey & Argent, 2018; Wulff et al.,2008). While Poulter and Sayers (2015) report global competition for skilled labour, much of the literature is focused on unskilled (low-wage) labour migration (Rye & Scott, 2018; Nelson & Nelson, 2010; Broadway, 2007). Labour migrants have been differentiated by their industry of employment (e.g., dairy workers, Poulter & Sayers, 2015) and temporal factors relating to both seasonality (Rye & Scott, 2018) and length of residence in the community (Wilson & Simmons, 2018). Wilson and Simmons (2018) describe considerable differentiation of labour migrants (originating from both overseas and New Zealand) within their time-based population transience continuum. Rye and Scott (2018) suggest that the focus in the literature has been on seasonal horticulture, with other areas of agriculture and food production relatively neglected. There have, however, been a number of studies of (international) labour migrants in food processing industries in both the USA and Canada (e.g., Broadway, 2000, 2007; Nelson & Nelson, 2010).

Similar key issues associated with labour migration were identified by both Rye and Scott (2018) and Wilson and Simmons (2018) and have been addressed in part by others. These include: rising demand for low-wage migrant labour (Wulff et al., 2008); challenges associated with housing seasonal workers and new labour migrants (Depner & Teixeira, 2012; Wilson & Simmons, 2018; Broadway, 2007); segmentation of labour markets (Wilson & Simmons, 2018); exploitation of migrant workers (Rye & Scott, 2018); and, migrants having an economic focus at the expense of familial, social and communal worlds (Rye & Scott, 2018). According to McAreavey and Argent (2018), social fragmentation, polarisation and contestation can lead to labour migrants feeling that they are part of the economy, but not connected socially. Immigrant vulnerability – in the event of crisis events – has been related to both employment type, and lack of access to family and community networks - see, for example, Woods (2018a) in respect of recession in Ireland and Wilson & Simmons (2018) post-earthquake in New Zealand. The presence of temporary migrant labour has been found to discourage the permanent settlement of immigrants (Depner & Teixeira, 2012).

2.3 Acceptance within the host community

The prior experience of the resident community (and its individual members) and the specific characteristics of immigrant populations are key factors influencing integration and acceptance in the community. The 'cosmopolitanism' suggested by Woods (2018a), for example, applies to both individuals and communities and potentially fosters positive outcomes (e.g., the cosmopolitanism of the resident population can make them more accepting of migrants) and negative outcomes (e.g., the cosmopolitanism of immigrants who maintain active links to their original home can foster distrust in the resident

population). While there is limited empirical evidence in support of this cosmopolitism on an individual level, a number of studies have focused on communities with no previous history of immigration (Doyle, 2018; McAreavey, 2018; van Kooy et al., 2019). According to van Kooy et al. (2019, p.8) “some members of the receiving community may require induction, resources and support to develop long-term acceptance of impending cultural change in their community”.

Wilson and Simmons (2018) reported a number of ‘immigrant’ initiatives focused on fostering acceptance within the resident population. In Norway, Berg-Nordlie (2018) noted that immigrants who contributed positively to the receiving society (both economically and socially) were appreciated more than those who sought shelter and assistance (e.g., refugees). Broadbent et al. (2007) reported that the promotion of employment, social and cultural advantages of refugees helped foster acceptance in the Australian communities. In rural Canada, initiatives towards positive community outcomes included the establishment of cultural awareness workshops and appointment of a community liaison officer (Broadway 2000). Community liaison officers – funded through both local governance bodies and employer networks – were also employed in two of Wilson and Simmons’ (2018) four New Zealand case study communities.

Acceptance of immigrant groups within the resident population is influenced by a range of factors including the scale and speed of change (MacDonald et al., 2012; Rye & Scott, 2018), the type of immigration experienced (as noted above) and previous experience of immigration in the community (Rye & Scott, 2018). Rye and Scott (2018) suggest that rural communities, in general, are not as familiar as urban areas with immigration, although Woods (2018a) suggests that immigration can be ‘normalised’ within the community via both community events which encompass migrant groups, and host community mobility which can normalise experience of diversity. Misconceptions around the immigration (visa) status of the immigrant population (MacDonald et al., 2012) and a strong focus on local majority-ethnic traditions has been shown to enable anti-immigration rhetoric and constrain integration (Berg-Nordlie, 2018). Woods (2018a) reported that discourse around immigrant groups within Irish communities described their presence as either ‘encouraged, tolerated, expedient or discouraged’.

Wilson & Simmons (2018) identified a range of immigrant characteristics which impact on the ease and extent to which the integration of new people in the community occurs, including: their length of time in the community (both actual and intended); employment type, location and work schedules; location and type of housing; age and family status; education participation and leisure interests. While these factors primarily describe characteristics of the immigrant population, a number of community characteristics which can both facilitate and hinder integration have been identified including, *inter alia*: the size of the community, the homogeneity of the resident population and the ‘tightness’ of the existing social networks (Brouwer, 2019); the availability and type of housing stock (Brown, 2017); the provision of adequate public transport services (Depner & Teixeira 2012; Wilson & Simmons, 2018); and the high degree of spatial dispersal which characterises many rural areas (Rye & Scott, 2018). Powe (2018), writing about small town revival with an emphasis on business growth, notes that place factors are important in respect of capacity for regeneration and the identification of locally specific challenges.

2.4 The community context

The importance of understanding the 'community context' in which immigrant activity occurs has emerged as key in respect of understanding both integration constraints and the availability of resources within communities. A 'well-developed understanding of settlement dynamics' was suggested by van Kooy et al. (2019) as a key success factor of regional settlement and aligns with Wilson and Simmons' (2018) calls for developing 'awareness of the community' as a first step towards community resilience. Powe et al. (2015) also note the importance of recognising 'local specificity within delivery' of regeneration programmes (this includes, historical and geographic factors, asset availability, political and policy contexts and local capacity/entrepreneurial initiatives). Brouwer (2019) notes that, alongside fostering positive community attitudes towards newcomers, it is also 'important to recognise each community's unique set of circumstances', including its geographic, demographic and socioeconomic characteristics.

While much of the early research on immigration, community integration and social change focused on large metropolitan urban areas this body of scholarship has been extended more recently to examine the settlement of refugee and labour migrants in regional and rural centres (Nelson & Nelson, 2010; Brown, 2017). According to McAreavey and Argent (2018), issues of scale and visibility, specific to the rural context, delineate rural migration from that occurring in urban areas. A special issue of the *Journal of International Migration and Integration* examined regional migration policies in Australia, Canada and New Zealand designed to attract new arrivals to hinterlands (Wulff et al., 2008). The benefits of attracting, integrating and retaining immigrants have been examined as a means to regenerate and support local economies (van Kooy et al., 2019), combat labour shortages (Wulff et al., 2008), and in respect of the revitalisation of town centres (Hospers, 2017).

An array of different sized settlements are found within regions and rural areas. The size of settlement under investigation represents an important contextual factor for understanding immigrant integration (i.e., settlement size potentially reflects the spatial and demographic characteristics of a particular settlement, the resources available within that settlement and the type of immigration under consideration). Settlement size also often reflects the settlement geographies of specific countries. Many Canadian studies, for example, focus on large towns (i.e., with populations of around 100,000-150,000 (Brown, 2017; Esses & Carter, 2019)) while in Europe Hospers (2017) and MacDonald et al. (2012) looked at medium-sized towns (i.e., with population of 50,000-100,000). In the UK, Powe (2018) examined settlements with 57,000 and 11,500 residents, while the population of Powe et al.'s (2015) three case study settlements ranged from 11,555 to 3,730. In Australia, Wulff and Dharmalingam (2008) defined small towns as having population less than 10,000. Woods' (2018a) two Irish case study towns had populations of 2299 and 2618, while Wilson and Simmons' (2018) New Zealand study looked at settlements containing between 100 and 25,000 people.

The size of a settlement (in spatial and demographic terms) impacts on the amount, type and quality of its infrastructure and community services, including those relating to the social milieu (i.e., the shared spaces found within the community). A number of structural 'local factors' (which Woods (2018a) suggested help shape cosmopolitanism) impact on the integration of immigrants in the community. These include the shared use

of singular spaces and services, any residential segregation, and having common workplaces. According to Woods (2018a), however, immigrants and long-term residents share a limited number of workplaces, shops and public facilities and there is not necessarily an equal interchange as, for example, when immigrants use extant community services (although some social spaces are not used) while residents do not engage in the same way with new migrant-owned ethnic food shops. Berg-Nordlie (2018) found immigrant participation in civic life to be strongly associated with sport, while Quirke (2015) examined the role of leisure activities in the building of social capital and suggested that participation in leisure activities could be used as a proxy for the study of settlement. However, Wilson and Simmons (2018) found that strong local majority-ethnic traditions (noted by Berg-Nordlie, 2018) extended to the provision (and promotion) of leisure and sport activities that were of limited interest to immigrants, labour migrants and newcomers in the communities they studied.

Van Kooy et al. (2019) also noted the importance of education institutions as anchoring sites in the community while Brouwer (2019) suggested that the provision of education opportunities was an important settlement factor with the availability of educational opportunity linked to immigrant satisfaction. The education system also represents a key arena for promoting the benefits of diversity and greater cultural sensitivity among all members of the community (Brouwer, 2019). MacDonald et al. (2012), however, noted a number of educational and fiscal challenges, and demands on resources within the community, associated with migrant families.

Another important aspect of 'community context' relates to the organisational social structures which are present in the community. Babis (2016), for example, reported on the diversity of immigrant organisations – the establishment and formality of which are determined by the size of the immigrant community – which can act as shared (social bridging) spaces within the community. Babis (2016) also suggested that some voluntary organisations are established as a counterpoint to address and highlight issues associated with racism and exclusion of immigrants within host communities. In Wilson and Simmons' (2018) study, employer-led organisations and employer-support of migrant labour groups provided a key community connector, although this was impacted significantly by the type of housing used by migrant labour groups.

2.5 Housing

Housing represents an important characteristic of place, although while a common set of housing challenges are reported, these manifest in different ways. According to Brouwer (2019) the availability of affordable and suitable housing can influence perceptions of a community as being 'welcoming' and affect access to social services. Wilson and Simmons (2018) found that affordable housing was an issue for everyone (i.e., including permanent residents) in the communities they studied and, although different (transient) population groups had different housing requirements, they were competing for limited housing availability. Furthermore, shared accommodations platforms such as AirBnB are a complicating factor in regional settlements (Campbell et al., 2019).

Many studies highlight place-specific housing issues. In Canada, for example, Brown (2017) found availability of rental housing to be the most significant barrier to integration in the community, whereas Scott and Gkartzios (2014) reported the dominance of

homeowner occupancy as a barrier to social diversity in the context of an oversupply of housing in rural Ireland. While Doyle's (2018) examination of 'houses of multiple occupancy' reflect a UK-specific housing regulatory circumstance, they also report issues of immigrant occupation of sub-standard and overcrowded housing. Discrimination against immigrants, and vulnerability associated with a lack of knowledge of their rights and responsibilities as tenants, has also been reported (Brouwer, 2019). Brown (2017) reported housing-related mobility issues arising from an inconvenient transit service and a lack of reliable housing information.

A range of community housing approaches to accommodate newcomers in the community are reported in the literature, although these have not always been successful. Broadway (2000), for example, attributes a limited supply of rental housing to minimal construction activity because of perceived low returns, and the fact that the creation of 'vacancy chains' failed to meet housing needs (e.g., attracting residents to new housing at the top end of market freeing up rental units at the bottom). Housing options for labour migrants include the provision of worker transport from more distant locations (Broadway, 2007), and the construction of on-site temporary housing for workers (Broadway, 2000, 2007; Wilson & Simmons, 2018). Problems accommodating seasonal workers are widely reported (Depner & Teixeira, 2012; Wilson & Simmons, 2018). Broadbent et al. (2007) also noted the importance of 'planning for the demand for housing and establishing a diversity of housing options' in respect of refugee settlement.

Nelson and Nelson (2010) point out that the separated residential geographies of low-wage immigrants and long-time residents pose challenges in respect of social interaction between groups in the community. Brown (2017) noted that neighbourhoods are important for understanding social inclusion. On-site worker accommodation (which is usually designed to be temporary) is sometimes purposefully integrated with the resident economy (e.g., the Kaikoura worker village, Wilson & Simmons, 2018) and sometimes totally segregated (Broadway, 2000). While the construction of purpose-built worker accommodation (by employer groups) within settlements (rather than on-site at workplaces) can ameliorate housing issues, this has also been found to foster segregation in the community (Wilson & Simmons, 2018). The dispersal of immigrant housing throughout the community is usually recommended (Broadway, 2000), with Woods (2018a) also suggesting that the small size of rural towns (with interspersed homes) makes immigrant populations more 'visible and thus knowable'. Wulff and Dharmalingam (2008), however, found that having children in the household, and the provision of settlement assistance from employers on arrival, were the factors most likely to increase social connectedness in the community, while housing tenure (along with English as a first language and age) were found to have no impact. McAreavey and Argent (2018) suggested that migrant housing conditions may exacerbate inequalities in the community.

3. Conclusion: Welcoming Communities

Overall, the majority of papers and reports reviewed say they will examine how to attract migrants, foster their integration and retain them in the community. While a range of potential facilitation initiatives are identified there is no clear empirical evidence of success in respect of the best strategies. They do identify key actions, but these seem to be considered theoretically (rather than practically). The 'welcoming community' (Wulff et al., 2008; Depner & Teixeira, 2012; Brouwer, 2019; Brown, 2017; Esses &

Carter, 2019, van Kooy et al., 2019) features across many papers, but is not supported by data that describes how it is achieved (see, for example, the Australian report on 'welcoming regions', Wulff et al., 2008).

Some papers in the literature reviewed set out lists of action points aimed at community integration which allude to an undefined array of 'welcoming community' factors. Brouwer (2019), for example, suggests that successful integration of immigrants needs to involve all stakeholders, needs funding, and needs to be promoted in the community. According to Wulff et al. (2008, p.123) "sustainable immigrant settlement is also more likely to succeed if it is community driven and entails a long-term and broad-based model of incorporating immigrants into communities as community builders and stakeholders". For Depner and Teixeira (2012, p.74), the successful integration of immigrants requires the provision of "quality services in a welcoming community". Broadly speaking, the challenges immigrants and migrant labour present and face within communities are able to be clearly identified and this understanding represents an important first step in achieving community integration. Rye and Scott (2018), for example, suggest that the community needs to understand the issues faced by migrant labour before they can address them. The identification and articulation of what makes a welcoming community is an area that needs more work. This is the focus of our ongoing research.

4. References and Annotations

Babis, D. (2016). Understanding diversity in the phenomenon of immigrant organizations: A comprehensive framework. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 17(2):355–369. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12134-014-0405-x

Paper suggests a comprehensive and systematic framework for better understanding one specific aspect (immigrant organisations) of the immigration process. While immigrant organisations are diverse, they can be described by four main variables: the attributes of the immigrant population; the characteristics of the country of origin; gaps vis-à-vis the host society; and, the attitudes and policies of the host society in relation to immigrants (p.356). Author differentiates 'immigrant' from 'ethnic' organisations – noting that "while every immigrant organization is an ethnic organization, not every ethnic organization is an immigrant organization" (p.358). Immigrant organisations may be oriented towards the country of origin, towards the new country or they may represent both (labelled as 'transnational'). They have also been described as either 'defensive' (as a response to social rejection) or 'offensive' (resulting from the immigrants' choice to differentiate themselves from the rest of the population).

Immigrant organisations both serve and represent the immigrant community. The size of the immigrant community determines the formality of organisations, while the age composition, gender and socioeconomic status of immigrants influence the type of organisation established. Political, economic and existential cultural circumstances in the home country also impact on the type of organisations established. Voluntary organisations (based on immigrants' culture, customs, language, and/or religion, which are different from those of the host country) serve as a framework for the creation and conservation of an ethno-cultural minority. Some voluntary organisations are established

as a counterpoint to address and highlight issues associated with racism and exclusion of immigrants within host communities.

Berg-Nordlie, M. (2018). New in town. Small-town media discourses on immigrants and immigration*. Journal of Rural Studies*, 64:210-219. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jrurstud.2018.05.007

Research article describing a media analysis, undertaken in three rural districts of Norway, which examined community attitudes towards immigrants and immigration. Results are discussed in respect of immigration changes over time, changes in interest in the subject, and according to three research questions addressing: immigration and the economy; the immigrant as a threat; and the immigrant as a participant in civic life. In all three districts, texts that discussed the economic effect of immigration primarily featured appreciative articulations.

A number of texts linked immigrants to criminal or cultural threats, with religion featuring as the most problematised aspect of immigrant culture. Opposition to the establishment of asylum seeker reception centres in the community was also reported, along with fears associated with criminal activity (associated with fake asylum seekers) and problems with genuine refugees (who might be psychologically unstable due to their experiences). Overall, “Texts that discussed asylum-seekers and refugees and Muslims were more likely to be critical, as articulators more frequently linked these groups to cultural and criminal threats” (p.218). These attitudes were strongly articulated in the only district to have a continuous presence of asylum seekers living in local reception centres.
The participation of immigrants in social and cultural life (and immigration improving Norwegian society and culture) was widely reported, often with a focus on the import of exotic ‘everyday culture’ (e.g., food traditions from immigrants' origin countries) although immigrants were also shown as contributing to mainstream culture. Immigrant participation in civic life was strongly associated with sport, with the author noting the ‘community-building function’ of participation in local sport and its importance ‘as an acceptance facilitating element’. Other civic participation included civil society activism and party politics. Overall, positive contributions to civic society outmatched those describing immigrants as a criminal or cultural threat.

Broadly speaking, appreciative attitudes were found to mainly apply to immigrants who are seen as capable of contributing to the receiving society through work or activism, while attitudes were more sceptical towards those who arrive looking for shelter and assistance. In one district, media reports explicitly drew on the importance of traditional Norwegian culture when articulating anti-immigration and anti-Islam discourse, which suggests that a strong focus on local majority-ethnic traditions may make it easier to criticise immigration publicly.

Broadbent, R., Cacciattolo, M. & Carpenter, C. (2007). A tale of two communities: Refugee relocation in Australia. *Australian Journal of Social Issues*, 42(4):581-601. https://doi.org/10.1002/j.1839-4655.2007.tb00079.x

An Australian paper which outlines the key challenges and issues facing two communities in which labour and population renewal strategies focused on refugee

relocation. Participation in the labour force, competence in English, and securing housing that is affordable and allows access to community-based resources were key indicators of successful or failed settlement (along with a recognition of qualifications, physical and psychological wellbeing and social connectedness). Four key community factors (for relocation programme success) were identified: a welcoming host community; the availability of employment and education opportunities; access to services; and, the ability for refugees to connect to their own community. This is hampered by the proscribed and (often) short-term nature of government policy relating to refugee support and a lack of relocation resources in rural communities (especially compared with urban areas). Other challenges included housing shortages (particularly of public and low-cost housing) and lack of employment opportunities. Within the host community, promotion of the employment, social and cultural value of refugees was needed to highlight potential advantages for rural communities and their economies.

Successful relocation projects need "strong partnerships, shared visions, community liaison and coordination" (p.593). Examples of community support and coordination include *inter alia:* the provision of community information; liaison with real estate agents; and engagement with volunteer networks, employers and employer groups. Eight components – relevant to all communities planning refugee planning projects (described on p.596) – potentially apply in respect of all migrants. These include planning for the demand for housing and establishing a diversity of housing options; a community development framework of practice that builds social capital; and, community planning undertaken at different stages in the relocation and resettlement process.

Broadway, M. (2000). Planning for change in small towns or trying to avoid the slaughterhouse blues. *Journal of Rural Studies*, 16(1):37-46.

Paper examines the challenges associated with an influx of new food processing workers in a rural Canadian community and identifies strategies to better facilitate such changes in the future. Author suggests that studies of rapid growth energy communities *('boomtowns'*) provide a useful framework for predicting social impact. Preparing for change necessitates acceptance that social changes are inevitable, and that such changes need to be embraced by communities. Responses to social impact fall into three broad groups:

- *migrant specific services* – e.g., the provision of ESL services and translators, the hiring of additional health care professionals
- *initiatives directed towards community integration* – e.g., cultural awareness workshops and establishing the position of a community liaison officer and a Diversity Committee, disperse new rental accommodations throughout the city
- *broader community service provision* – e.g., the creation of an interagency service provider group and provision of community welfare facilities (e.g., homeless shelters). Author notes in the conclusion that there is a need for local community committees to have access to decision-making bodies.

Housing shortages are reported to present a significant community challenge. Difficult to attract rental unit construction because of perceived low returns. On-site worker housing is temporary and is designed to segregate workers from the wider community. Housing

needs have not been met by creation of vacancy chains (i.e., attracting residents to new housing at top end of market thus freeing up rental units at the bottom).

Broadway, M. (2007). Meatpacking and the transformation of rural communities: A comparison of Brooks, Alberta and Garden City, Kansas. *Rural Sociology*, 72(4):560-582. https://doi.org/10.1526/003601107782638701

In both the US and Canada, the shift of meatpacking to rural areas was reliant on immigrant labour. Such population movement likened to that of 'boomtowns' whereby sudden population growth was accompanied by increases in social disorders. Housing shortages (sparking increases in rents and property prices) one of the first issues to occur, followed by a lag in the provision of social services. Within the community, social cohesion and stability replaced by increases in social isolation, lower levels of social and community support and fewer informal community contacts; issues further exacerbated by high levels of residential mobility. Social issues associated with large populations of young single males. New housing developments which followed were purchased by existing residents, releasing older housing stock and rental accommodation for newcomers. Increased demand for schools and need for English language education services. Mostly about the social impacts occurring within these communities (rather than what can be done to facilitate integration). Conclusion notes that over time (25 years in the US city) a Spanish '*majority-minority*' community had become established and had become 'part of its cultural landscape'. A more complex multicultural community (with no majority group) was reported in Canada, although cultural integration of some African groups had occurred.

Brouwer, N. (2019). *Supporting the settlement and integration of newcomers in the Northwest Territories*. Research Paper, University of Ottawa. https://ruor.uottawa.ca/handle/10393/39096

Canadian research paper which questioned whether policymakers in the Northwest Territories should take on more responsibility in settling and integrating immigrants and, if so, how can they better support immigrants settling and integrating into the territory's small and remote communities. Settlement strategies were examined via an academic literature and policy literature review. The most important factors, for successfully settling newcomers in small and remote communities, included opportunities for employment, social connection, housing, education, and settlement services. Within academic literature these represent key characteristics of a 'welcoming community':

- Employment opportunities in the community – meaningful employment opportunities (e.g., that matches their skills and training) providing financial autonomy and employment satisfaction (including addressing foreign credential recognition issues). Smaller centres may have a more favourable social context (e.g., facilitating networking) in respect of supporting newcomers integrate into the labour market (Danson & Jentsch, 2012)

- Social connections within the community – forming positive relationships based on acceptance and inclusivity of diversity. Within the wider community this involves interacting with friendly, welcoming locals; immigrants with a more

diverse network in the community were more satisfied than those whose circle of friends came from within their ethno-cultural community (Sapeha, 2015). Maintaining networks within immigrants own ethno-cultural communities are important as both a support mechanism and for the maintenance of cultural continuity. The presence of family and friends is crucial to the integration process. Challenges in respect of fostering these connections include: the small size of some immigrant population groups; the relative homogeneity (e.g., ethnic origin, culture and language) of many small rural communities; and, the 'tightness' of existing local networks.

- Affordable and suitable housing – shown to influence perceptions of a community as being 'welcoming' and affect access to social services, such as education. Housing inventories in smaller centres are often limited (in supply), represent older stock (which may be substandard) and unaffordable. Other housing barriers encountered by immigrants included perceived discrimination by landlords and vulnerability associated with a lack of knowledge of their rights and responsibilities as tenants. Small communities need to develop effective affordable housing strategies, in collaboration with all levels of government.

- Educational opportunities with greater cultural sensitivity – the education system was noted as a key factor for promoting the benefits of diversity and greater cultural sensitivity among all members of the community. Educational institutions play a key role in integrating newcomer children and their families into their communities. However, the facilitation of understanding and cooperation within the community, more broadly, was reliant on awareness of the diversity of cultural norms. The availability of educational opportunity is often linked to immigrant satisfaction.

- Availability of effective settlement services – settlement services are one of the first impressions that newcomers will have of the community and it is recommended that providers of these services "must invest in professional development opportunities for their staff and ensure skills like self-awareness, cross-cultural knowledge, and language diversification are fostered so that organizations can effectively meet the needs of the clients they're serving" (p.36). Effective services should have the capacity to adapt to changes in immigrant needs and be able to provide appropriate language assistance to the immigrants present in their community. Although smaller communities offer more personalised settlement services, they are often restricted in respect of their service capacity.

The same factors are instrumental for attracting and retaining newcomers to the community. However, lifestyle factors (e.g., quality of life, slow pace, quiet atmosphere, weather, lack of crime), identified as important in respect of attraction and retention, are less often reported in settlement and integration literature.

While overall, it is important for there to be positive attitudes towards immigrants, cultural diversity, and the presence of newcomers in the community it is also important to recognise each community's unique set of circumstances, including its geographic, demographic, and socioeconomic characteristics.

The paper outlines three key policy recommendations for improving settlement outcomes and integration of immigrants:

1. Launch a community engagement process, involving a broad array of stakeholders
2. Implement a grants program, to support both labour and social integration
3. “Meet your Neighbour” campaign, to promote the benefits of immigration

Also see:
Danson, M., & Jentsch, B. (2012). International migration and economic participation in small towns and rural areas - cross-national evidence. *Migration Letters*, 9(3):215-224. doi:3368213J8324U276

Sapeha, H. (2015). Explaining variations in immigrants' satisfaction with their settlement experience. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*,16(4):891-910. doi:10.1007/s12134-014-0371-3

Brown, N. R. (2017). Housing experiences of recent immigrants to Canada’s small cities: The case of North Bay, Ontario. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 18(3):719–747. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12134-016-0498-5

Canadian study which examined the connection between immigrants’ housing experiences, interactions with neighbours and landlords and their perceptions of the city as a welcoming community. The ‘small city’ on which the research was focused had a population of 100,000 and is reported as a valuable extension of research focused on larger urban places. Three classes of immigrant were identified (family, economic, refugee) although the study only included the first two of these. The author also notes that, while many studies have focused on the characteristics of immigrants as factors impacting integration success, housing integration can be facilitated or hindered by community characteristics, and that neighbourhoods are important for understanding social inclusions.

In addition to interviewing and conducting focus groups with immigrants, key informant interviews were conducted with landlords. The study focuses on housing experiences, with the availability of rental housing found to be the most significant barrier to integration in the community. Other barriers were “affordability, a lack of reliable housing information, initial hesitance of landlords, limited knowledge of rights and responsibilities, the age and condition of rental properties and housing stock and mobility issues arising from an inconvenient transit service” (p.721). These housing experiences were found to have either a positive or neutral impact on perceptions of a welcoming community; relationships with co-workers and employers were seen as being more important in perceptions of a ‘welcoming community’. Walton-Roberts (2005) found that in addition to providing income, employment facilitated wider community acceptance through integration in the workplace. It has also been argued that smaller communities put more effort into creating welcoming cities (Walton-Roberts, 2005).

The literature reviewed highlights the complexity of the relationship between immigration and housing, with a variety of immigrant housing experiences occurring (e.g., having sufficient income to ‘comfortably’ achieve upward mobility, ‘difficulty and sacrifice’

associated with housing ownership, and 'languishing' in the rental market): "The achievement of home ownership is seen as an important indicator of integration as it signals commitment to the new country" (p.724).

The conclusion section of the paper identifies a number of specific community initiatives important in respect of building welcoming cities: identifying the role that municipalities can play; assisting newcomers to familiarise themselves with the community by providing host families as initial contacts; adapting processes and engagement with both the immigrant and resident population to accommodate the diversity of immigrants and changes in their needs over time. The author also notes the importance of providing centralised housing information.

Also see:
Murdie, R., & Teixeira, C. (2003). Towards a comfortable neighbourhood and appropriate housing: immigrant experiences in Toronto. In P. Anisef & M. Lanphier (Eds.), *The world in a city* (pp. 132–191). Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Ray, B., & Preston, V. (2009). Are immigrants socially isolated? An assessment of neighbors and neighboring in Canadian cities. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 10:217-244.

Walton-Roberts, M. (2005). Regional immigration and dispersal: lessons from small- and medium-sized urban centres in British Columbia. *Canadian Ethnic Studies*, 37(3):12–34.

Walton-Roberts, M. (2011). Immigration, the university and the welcoming second tier city. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 12(4):453-473.

Campbell, M., McNair, H., Mackay, M., & Perkins, H. C. (2019). Disrupting the regional housing market: Airbnb in New Zealand. *Regional Studies, Regional Science*, 6(1), 139-142.

The role of accommodation-sharing platforms, such as Airbnb, is seen as a disruption to more conventional accommodation providers and rental markets in many cities and regions worldwide. This Regional Graphic focuses on New Zealand, showing a snapshot in time of the spatial distribution of the accommodation provided by Airbnb. What the map shows are patterns of statistically significant mildly positive clustering (Moran's $I = 0.33$, $p \leq 0.05$) of the Airbnb locations. The 'traditional' tourism hotspots, mainly in the South Island of New Zealand, for example, Wanaka or Queenstown (Queenstown Hill, Lake Hayes South, Sunshine Bay), and the largest city, Auckland (Central West, East, Habourside and Waiheke Island), are shown. A few of the highest ranked places also feature a high intensity per usually resident person. For example, Queenstown Hill has 204 Airbnb listings per 1000 residents. The area with the highest number of Airbnbs is Wanaka, a smaller South Island tourist destination. A key issue for future research is how short-term rentals pose a challenge to local authorities who collect property taxes based on the value of the property, with some local authorities (e.g., Auckland) proposing or enacting specific by-laws in relation to Airbnb.

Coakley, L. & Éinri, P. M. (2016). Migration to rural Ireland: A North Cork case study. In *International migration and rural areas: Cross-national comparative perspectives*. Jentsch, B. & Simard, M. (Eds). 99-126. Routledge: Abingdon, UK.

Study designed to provide evidence to inform effective inter-agency engagement with the dynamics of new communities in North Cork and beyond. Within this, the primary research goals were to assess immigrant needs, expose the barriers to integration and highlight any facilitating factors. Authors note that 'intercultural' represents a qualitatively different approach to that implied by 'multicultural' (i.e., the former promotes active engagement between groups, the latter simply recognises ethnic variations). Describes the provision of community support services for education, employment, housing, health and welfare, and those provided by non-statutory service providers. Note the difference in access to/provision of community support services for different types of immigrants (related to legal residence status) and, in particular, differences between asylum seekers/refugees and labour migrants.

Colic-Peisker, V. (2009). Visibility, settlement success and life satisfaction in three refugee communities in Australia. *Ethnicities*, 9(2):175-199. https://doi.org/10.1177/1468796809103459

Australian study which examines settlement success and life satisfaction in three refugee communities. Primarily focuses on the refugee experience, but the following points are of note with respect to refugee populations: they need more support than other immigrants; ethnic characteristics make them more visible in the community (with some negative consequences); they experience significant employment challenges (which is important as employment considered to be the single most important aspect of migrant integration). Relative deprivation theory used to explain the ways in which new refugee arrivals contain their social comparison within their own ethnic community, do not have a strong sense of social entitlement and do not expect full social inclusion; "in later stages of settlement, however, the discourse of gratitude may start to dissipate"(p.194).

Depner, W. & Teixeira, C. (2012). Welcoming communities? An assessment of community services in attracting and retaining immigrants in the South Okanagan Valley (British Columbia, Canada), with policy recommendations. *The Journal of Rural and Community Development*, 7(2):72-97.

Paper mainly focused on permanent immigrants. Identify a range of services which affect the settlement experience of immigrants (e.g., arts and leisure services, recreation and local festivals). Immigrants do not represent a homogenous group – need to recognise that and tailor services accordingly. Two biggest challenges are lack of physical access to community services (lack of public transport) and financial instability (from low-paid seasonal employment). Seasonal workers present challenges for local service providers and community leaders with workers experiencing problems associated with inadequate housing, long working hours and language barriers.

Doyle, C. (2018). Housing in UK New Immigration Destinations: Planning, houses of multiple occupation and the challenges of uncertainty. *Journal of Rural Studies*, 64:276-288. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jrurstud.2018.05.003

Article describes issues associated with the registration, increased use and overcrowding of HMO (houses with multiple occupancy) in the UK which are commonly occupied by migrants. The author reports a number of data sources which capture population growth and demographic characteristics, noting that these data do not always align. The author also identifies a number of housing-related issues including the suggestion that migration is characterised by complex forms, particularly in respect of population transience. Paper makes some links between lack of registration (of HMO properties) and sub-standard housing and between overcrowded and informal housing.

Esses, V. & Carter, C. (2019). *Beyond the big city: How small communities across Canada can attract and retain newcomers*. Public Policy Forum: Pathways to Prosperity, Canada. http://p2pcanada.ca/library/beyond-the-big-city-how-small-communities-across-canada-can-attract-and-retain-newcomers/

Report provides a concise overview of key attraction and retention factors relevant to the settlement of immigrant groups in smaller communities. Strategies employed include information sharing via web portals; fostering welcoming communities (via the identification of service needs and gaps of immigrants in the community, developing projects to support the integration of refugees and hosting cultural events to bring together immigrants with the local community); employer-supported initiatives; and the provision of relocation incentives.

Welcoming communities that successfully attract and retain immigrants require input from multiple groups including: the receiving community; the municipal, federal and provincial governments; organizations that provide community services; and, the companies that hire immigrants. The report provides a tabled set of specific recommendations for the attraction and retention of immigrants that can be implemented in both the short- and long-term.

Hebbani, A. & Khawaja, N. G. (2019). Employment aspirations of former refugees settled in Australia: A mixed methods study. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 20(3):907-924. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12134-018-0635-4

Study examines employment-related aspirations of refugees resettled in Australia and identified obstacles to achieving employment-related goals. Finding employment can be very difficult for refugees. Barriers to employment included low proficiency in English, lack of computer literacy, financial constraints, family care demands, ill health, lack of knowledge about employment training and job seeking pathways. Employment is seen as crucial to successful community integration – leads to economic self-sufficiency, represents a “critical element of building social connections within the broader community” (p.909).

Hospers, G. J. (2017). People, place and partnership: Exploring strategies to revitalise town centres. *European Spatial Research and Policy*, 24(1):65-79. https://doi.org/10.1515/esrp-2017-0004

European paper in which the author suggests that town centre revitalisation is contingent on connecting people, place and partnership. Focus is on medium-sized towns (i.e., 50,000-100,000 pop., although one town discussed had only 21,000 inhabitants) and the central (downtown) areas within these. While the retail sector is suggested as a key indicator of town centre vibrancy, the author notes that "every town centre is unique and requires a tailor-made and place-based strategy" (p.66). Three factors which impact on town centre attractiveness are identified: being contained within a compact area; the human scale (e.g., being multifunctional and social places); and, having a unique profile.

MacDonald, J., Sampson, R. J., Carr, P. J., Lichter, D. Y. & Kefalas, M. J. (2012). Can immigration save small-town America? Hispanic boomtowns and the uneasy path to renewal. *Annals AAPSS*, 641(1):38-57. https://doi.org/10.1177/0002716211433445

This American paper examines the opportunities and challenges faced by small towns in incorporating new residents of differing ethnic heritage, cultural values and skin colour. The authors noted that:

- new migrants provide economic benefits through tax payments and consumer purchasing, although challenges occur in respect of direct arrivals from overseas (e.g., they may have limited understanding of local customs and the English language and are not familiar with political and social institutions)
- migrant families help boost school rolls (with higher fertility rates adding ongoing benefits) but raise new educational and fiscal challenges (e.g., ESOL)
- place demands on resources within the community (e.g., health, education and public assistance)
- the speed (and sometimes unexpectedness) of non-native population settlement can have a destabilising impact on the resident community

The contrasting experiences of two communities are described. In one, significant misconception around the legality of the immigrant population was a prominent feature in local discourse, and immigration presented as a divisive issue in the community. In the other, strategic planning and integration initiatives were perceived to have 'instilled a spirit of mutual understanding and accommodation, helping the process of community integration'. Possible explanations for these differences include the scale (i.e., the proportion of the population represented by immigrants as well as their absolute number) and speed of change, and differences in the social and political climate at each place. Schools, churches and social-service providers have played a prominent role in fostering community integration.

Broader issues noted were the lack of clarity around immigration policy (which is enacted at different governance scales) and a need for better understanding of the net impacts of immigration on small towns. Further to this last point, clarity in the publicising of information (to counter misinformation) is important.

McAreavey, R. & Argent, N. (2018). New Immigration Destinations (NID) unravelling the challenges and opportunities for migrants and for host communities. *Journal of Rural Studies*, 64:148-152. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jrurstud.2018.09.006

A special issue focused on international migration to rural and regional communities (in Europe and Australia) with little prior experience of migration. Distinguishes between lifestyle, entrepreneurial and labour migrants, and refugees. Migration is broadly impacted by 'shifting patterns of production and consumption in rural areas' and 'migration governance and the global displacement of people'. Individual papers focus on:

- *Cosmopolitanism* – the increasing complexity of migration leads to nested understandings of 'the local' and 'the global' among both host societies and new arrivals.
- *Labour migrants* – structural transformations in agriculture have led to increases in farm size and increased dependence on low wage workers, often from other countries. The supply of seasonal workers is dependent on political economy, whilst demand is impacted by the often 'temporary, part-time, risky and generally unpredictable nature' of this work. Experiences of social fragmentation, polarisation and contestation, can lead to labour migrants feeling that they are part of the economy, but are not connected socially.
- *Migration discourse: the media and local elites* – the media promote different migrant narratives. Migrants are valued for economic rather than social or cultural contributions to communities. Rather than competing with locals, migrants often take jobs that locals do not want.
- *Lifestyle migrants* – many lifestyle migrants do not have 'economic development aspirations' and may become enveloped in their own sub group and be socially isolated from the local population. Questions around whose 'voice gets heard in local debates about sustainability'.
- *Community and local governance* – support structures are dependent on local context and may perpetuate precarity and inequalities. Everyday spaces (e.g., schools, libraries, etc) are important for the integration of migrant and longer term resident populations. Migrant housing conditions may exacerbate inequalities in the community (see Doyle paper, same edition of Journal).

Overall, the uneven incorporation of migrants reinforces the importance of context: "Everyday encounters represent the melding of macro, meso and micro structures, and are often facilitated through the actions of individual actors" (p.151). Issues of scale and visibility, specific to the rural context, delineate rural migration from that occurring in urban areas. Economic and labour uncertainty impacts on the sustainability of migrant groups in the community, and on the sustainability of policies and actions designed to assist/welcome migrants.

Montayre, J., Neville, S. & Holroyd, E. (2017). Moving backwards, moving forward: The experiences of older Filipino migrants adjusting to life in New Zealand. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies on Health and Well-being*, 12(1). https://doi.org/10.1080/17482631.2017.1347011

A qualitative study which looks at the migration experience of older migrants with a focus on health issues. Remaining connected to their own heritage was found to be integral to adjusting to life in New Zealand.

Nayar, S. (2015). Resituating models of acculturation: An occupational dimension. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 16(4):1141-1155. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12134-014-0379-8

New Zealand study which examines acculturation from an occupational – rather than cultural psychology – perspective. Acculturation is revealed as a "transactional process embedded within time and across social and environmental contexts" (p.1141). Immigrants are usually categorised according to one of four acculturative strategies – integration, marginalisation, separation or assimilation – but, in reality, can practice all four at different times.

Nelson, L. & Nelson, P. B. (2010). The global rural: Gentrification and linked migration in the rural USA. *Progress in Human Geography*, 35(4):441-459. https://doi.org/10.1177/0309132510380487

Paper examines 'linked migration' in which the arrival of different migrant streams are conceptualised as being structurally linked – and overlap spatially – rather than being subject to separate processes and attracted to different destinations. According to the authors, "most empirical and theoretical work on immigration, social integration, and community change is grounded in urban settings" (p.454). The authors suggest that the arrival of middle and upper class amenity migrants can transform local housing markets and new construction in rural destinations. The rural gentrification associated with amenity migration, in turn, stimulates demand for low-wage service workers. Rural industrial restructuring (and, in particular, new and expanding food-processing industries) may also attract new low-wage migrants to the same communities. Latino low-wage people less visible in the community. Amenity migration studies have focused on the interactions between wealthy white migrants and the longstanding resident population who are also often primarily white. The separated residential geographies of low-wage immigrants and long-time residents (resulting from the high and exclusionary cost of local housing) pose challenges in respect of social interaction between different groups. Low-wage immigrants potentially also interact with wealthy amenity migrants in the community.

Poulter, C. & Sayers, J. G. (2015). Retention of skilled migrants in the New Zealand Dairy Industry. *New Zealand Journal of Employment Relations*, 40(2):1-23.

Paper which primarily addresses the employment of skilled migrants in the New Zealand dairy industry. In the context of intensified competition for skilled migrant labour globally,

the study examines challenges and opportunities encountered by skilled migrant labour in New Zealand and identifies the most important factors enabling migrant integration, settlement and retention in the dairy industry. While the majority of these factors relate to the migrants' perspective, the authors also note the importance of community infrastructure to support migrants. Research results identified the development of industry-coordinated social integration assistance as an area for improvement. Paper is quite badly written.

Powe, N. (2018). Non-amenity business growth and small town revival. *Journal of Rural Studies*, 62:125-133. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jrurstud.2018.07.013

Examines the potential for business growth (i.e., improving the demand for and supply of local products and services) in non-amenity sectors within small towns. 'Amenity' sectors are described as those associated with landscape, heritage and culture, and are often supported by urban accessibility. While demand policies focus on industrial attraction, business retention, growth and start-ups, and supply policies focus on improving efficiency of local business (e.g., through tackling remoteness and improving the labour supply), the author claims that there has been a lack of focus on 'place'. Research findings are very specific to each of the two case study communities, confirming the thesis that place factors are important in respect of capacity for regeneration. Success factors identified included: attractiveness as a residential and leisure location; offering a low cost location to operate business (e.g. low salaries), low living costs, and short travel times for staff; 'accidents of history and geography'; positive attitude towards business expansion; the presence of entrepreneurial and business leaders with connection to the area; having some potential to become a leisure destination through business regeneration aligned to amenity-oriented revival; and, a move away from a dependency culture (i.e., not waiting for outside help).

Location constraints included: poor broadband and transport infrastructure; political focus towards larger companies; road access challenges (i.e., not being located on a through route, distance to motorways); feelings of local government neglect; absence of residential desirability advantages; loss of local services; psychological factors associated with past losses in the community; resistance to change; and difficulties recruiting skilled and professional staff.

Powe, N., Pringle, R. & Hart, R. (2015). Matching the process to the challenge within small town regeneration. *TPR*, 86(2):177-202. https://doi.org/10.3828/tpr.2015.11

A UK paper which examines the effectiveness of government initiated programmes aimed at small town regeneration, wherein small towns face challenges which are "long-term, complex/multi-dimensional, involving many actors and having locally specific challenges" (p.177). Authors note that many programmes failed to address negative local practices (such as competition between towns) and remoteness from their local authority. External agencies likely to play a blend of facilitative and directive roles, with the latter often overemphasised (due to timescales associated with policy/political agendas and a lack of trust in the delivery capabilities of local actors). The importance of 'local specificity within delivery', along with self-help and self-determination within the

local community, are noted as success factors. While impacted by austerity measures at governance level, greater local agency can be gained via collaboration (i.e., shared knowledge/learning, pooling of resources and speaking with a collective voice) across communities in rural areas. The efficacy of collaboration may be constrained by longstanding rivalries and concerns about loss of community identity and control. This case study research (focused on a number of communities located in a valley) found in some cases that collaboration between communities became a 'focus for rivalry', while there was a lack of communication/cooperation within some communities. Success (of a development strategy programme) was identified through the inclusion of local area partnerships within local plans and the ongoing development of 'non-controversial' schemes (e.g., the local canal forming a linear park). Transport and tourism were identified as important cross-valley groups which had lasted beyond the life of the strategy. Within the communities involved there were calls for improved communication of key projects. The importance of community activities emerging at the local level was a key finding. However, this strategy-led programme was viewed as too slow by local residents; there is also a need to be more realistic about what can be achieved through (often short-term) government support. Ideal is for "repeated 'small wins' over long periods" (p.198).

Quirke, L. (2015). Searching for joy: The importance of leisure in newcomer settlement. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 16(2):237–248. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12134-014-0388-7

Paper based on a review of literature on newcomer leisure, settlement and information behaviour with the author proposing a conceptual framework for the study of leisure and information across settlement. Explores the role and importance of leisure and recreation in settlement processes and the ways in which information relevant to settlement is shared within leisure settings. Author goes on to outline the potential role of leisure activities in bolstering mental health and the building of social capital by newcomers. Leisure activity can influence and reflect a newcomer's social network and economic well-being.

Barriers to leisure (which reflect other barriers to settlement and integration) include unemployment or unpredictable working schedules; social isolation; family separation; racial and other forms of discrimination; lack of secure migration status; and, lack of information about available programmes and services. As such, the author suggests that participation in leisure activities could be used as a proxy for the study of settlement. Shared leisure can foster both bonding (in-group) and bridging (between groups) social capital; also, economic well-being has been linked to the ethnicity of newcomers' leisure partners (with those who participated exclusively in co-ethnic leisure pursuits found to have lower incomes). Concludes by saying that information about leisure and recreation should be more widely recognised as a settlement need. Overall, this paper is simply aligning the established migration settlement material to a leisure framework and is primarily focused on the experience of the migrant. Does suggest that "it would be useful for researchers, policymakers and recreation service providers to learn more about the needs, interests and preferences of newcomer groups in order to better design and deliver programmes that meet their needs" (p.245).

Rye, J. F. & Scott, S. (2018). International labour migration and food production in rural Europe: A review of the evidence. *Sociologia Ruralis,* 58(4): 928-952. https://doi.org/10.1111/soru.12208

Low-wage labour migration driven by demand in agriculture and food processing represents main population inflow into rural Europe. However, focus in literature has been on seasonal horticulture, with other areas of agriculture and food production relatively neglected. Seven key issues associated with low-wage labour migration, contemporary food production and rural change are identified:

1. *Rising demand for low-wage migrant labour* – demographic shifts (depopulation and ageing), changes in rural economy (women in labour market, out-migration of youth, growth of service employment) have reduced pool of labour available. Migrants are suggested to be more productive (and appealing to employers) as they represent a flexible labour force, are more motivated and more likely to accept low wages and poor working conditions.
2. *Regulating the supply of migrant labour* – global processes have eased barriers to mobility with states playing a vital role in facilitating low-wage labour migration. While guest worker schemes represent a 'triple-win' – benefitting the workers, and the sending and receiving countries – they have been criticised for having an economic (profit) focus at the expense of migrants' 'familial, social and communal worlds.'
3. *Migrant workers and the segmentation of labour markets* – important sub-hierarchies (based on duration of employment, degree of informalisation, direct vs indirect employment, form of renumeration) are found in migrant secondary labour markets. Other segmentation occurs in respect of worker origin ('locals' and migrants), migrant origin (based on ethnic, national, religious or racial factors), gender and hierarchical nuances within population groups.
4. *The (hidden) exploitation of migrant workers in rural areas* – often linked to migrants' citizenship status.
5. *Channelling migrants into rural food production* – intermediaries such as recruitment agencies reduce direct worker-employer relationship, affect migrant's welfare beyond the workplace, diminish scope of employer responsibility. Pioneer migrants may themselves adopt an intermediary role.
6. *Migrants' agency* – agency related to ability to transfer money to their home country (remittance activity) and create trans-local *milieus* within rural areas in which they live (including in-situ forms of conviviality that demonstrate a commitment to local people and places). This agency can serve as a springboard to attain work and financial stability and achieve family goals. Some evidence of collective agency action reported (often supported by locals) although the 'refreshment' of migrant labour can prevent the development of collective bonds.
7. *Labour migrants and rural integration* – integration process evolves differently between rural and urban areas. Limited research into conditions of labour migrants in rural communities and poor understanding of the ways in which migrants navigate social structures. Rural communities with minimal experience of immigration are poorly equipped to manage rate and pace of change now occurring. Rural underclass may develop as a result of migrants' social isolation and poor living and working conditions. Integration also impacted by citizenship status and employment characteristics (e.g., work schedules and location, length

of contracts, size of workforce, nature of relationship between employers and migrant workers). Broader factors include structure of rural society (low population, spatial dispersal), social and cultural distance and the 'identity frontier' between the migrant and host society (with preferences for migrants of particular ages, family structure or nationality). Labour migrants in rural areas are often: *Living in places unused to accommodating diversity; invisible and hidden from view; relatively isolated; dependent on a major industry/employer; unable to cluster in conventional ethnic neighbourhoods; lacking ethnic infrastructure; reliant on tied accommodation; dependent on precarious forms of employment (temporary or seasonal); linked to an intermediary for work, accommodation and event transport; tied to a specific specialist visa and thus employer; and, hoping that their low-wage work is a stepping stone to more rewarding forms of employment (p.942).*

Scott, M. & Gkartzios, M. (2014). Rural housing: Questions of resilience. *Housing and Society,* 41(2):247-276. DOI: 10.1080/08882746.2014.11430630

Irish study. Identifies equilibrium and evolutionary resilience. Financial vulnerability in housing markets associated with economic concentration on housing sector construction. Very little formal connection between rural housing policies and rural development strategies. Dominance of homeowner occupation in rural Ireland – minimises social diversity (a negative in respect of community sustainability). Economic circumstance (Celtic Tiger) led to oversupply of housing. Not sure this has much relevance, as its focus is on community and environment impacts of dispersed rural housing in respect of the long-term resident population.

Sibley, C. G. & Ward, C. (2013). Measuring the preconditions for a successful multicultural society: A barometer test of New Zealand. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 37(6):700-713. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijintrel.2013.09.008

Quantitative study of attitudes towards multiculturalism. Authors suggest that multiculturalism should consider the presence of diversity, the ways in which it is accommodated by individuals and organisations and an assessment of how commonplace it is. Suggests a definition of multiculturalism that allows both for the maintenance of individual cultures and positive intergroup contact. Describes and tests for the presence of the 'reciprocity effect' (i.e., intercultural relations are interactive, mutual and reciprocal) whereby one group in society liking another will trigger a reciprocal positive affect. Study findings confirmed this hypothesis. Another (perhaps useful) finding was that New Zealanders "resisted a resource-specific multicultural ideology that involves race-based interventions to reduce social inequality" (p.710).

van Kooy, J., Wickes, R. & Aleem, A. (2019). *Welcoming regions: An evidence-based approach to regional migrant settlement*. Monash Migration and Inclusion Centre (MMIC). https://welcomingcities.org.au/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/WelcomingRegions_Evidence_final.pdf

A review of existing evidence on regional migration settlement in Australia. Scenarios for migrant settlement initiatives. Regional "less-populated areas are thought to hold the potential to 'speed up' integration through employment opportunities and migrants' closer exposure to elements of Australian culture and English language" (p.4). Much of this paper focuses on attracting long-term migrants (e.g., refugees, urban settlers) to the regions – while similar issues arise as for labour migrants there are some which are not as applicable.

Outlines key success factors of regional settlement:

- *Strategic consultation, planning and budgeting* – consultation should include: a proactive federal strategy that addresses needs of settlement service providers; a localised approach to the design of migrant settlement schemes (to accommodate the diversity of local contexts); the involvement of a range of local stakeholders (e.g., business people, TAFE teachers, volunteer tutors, local library staff, council etc); partnerships with extant migrant groups and ethno-specific community organisations; input from the migrants themselves. Planning should begin prior to migrant arrival and be adaptive and ongoing. Funding arrangements need to be flexible; drawn from a variety of sources; and distributed via multiple channels (e.g., to individuals, support organisations etc).
- *Welcoming attitudes and cultural awareness in receiving communities* – also a well-developed understanding of settlement dynamics. Requires consultation and social impact assessments prior to settlement, fostering a welcoming culture (practical contributions, information provision and volunteer support). Community preparedness (in respect of welcoming) 'grounded in experience with previous waves of immigration' (p.8) – suggests that community with little history of immigration face difficulties bridging cultural divides between established groups and newcomers. Notes that "some members of the receiving community may require induction, resources and support to develop long-term acceptance of impending cultural change in their community" (p.8). For migrants "local policies that focus on developing a sense of belonging over time contribute to successful settlement" (p.8).
- *Established ethnic communities and multicultural institutions* – can provide an anchor for new arrivals. A critical mass of people from the same or related ethnic backgrounds helps consolidate settlement and attract others. The variable nature of public service provision (i.e., often a lack of it) places greater importance on having local ethnic community and multicultural institutions; educational institutions are important anchoring sites.
- *Employment that matches demand with the characteristics of new migrants* – does not apply in the case of labour migrants, but is very important for long-term new migrants and refugees especially as regional labour markets are often quite 'thin' (limited depth and variety of employment, few options for advancement). Employers play an important role, depending on the local context (provide settlement support, act as hosts and cultural ambassadors, are determinants of current or future residency prospects for migrants).

- *Availability and accessibility of housing and culturally-appropriate services* – variations in availability of language and medical services, access to services impacted by migrants' visa conditions. Need to understand needs of migrants (not homogenous). Availability of affordable housing and public transport key constraints in respect of attracting migrants. 'Double disadvantage' on arrival, as rural areas are not as well serviced as urban areas. Having no history of intercultural contact can limit the potential for culturally-competent service provision. Effective employment services are important, including pre-arrival and post-arrival settlement and employment information; professional and peer support; and, community social contact, networking and support. Also, support for employers.
- *Sustainability* – needs to be considered across multiple dimensions: duration of migrant settlement; retention of employment, prospects for career advancement and occupational mobility; prospects for migrants' children to remain in location.

Four opportunity and risk scenarios, to suit different regional immigration contexts, are proposed:

1. Destinations for new and emerging migrant communities
2. Regions of welcome for refugees
3. Demand driven economic gain
4. Optimal migrant settlement

The above differ in respect of planning and operational requirements, migrant profiles (i.e., suitability of location by type of migrant) and the provision of information and knowledge sources.

Wilson, J. & Simmons, D. (2018). *Building resilience in transient rural communities – a post-earthquake regional study: Fieldwork report*. Resilience to Nature's Challenges Project 032.
https://researcharchive.lincoln.ac.nz/handle/10182/10438

A New Zealand research project which focused on community resilience to natural hazard events, with a focus on transient population groups. Study was based on four rural communities impacted by the 2016 Kaikoura earthquake. While the four communities varied across social (population size, demographic characteristics, community service provision), geographic (spatial location, isolation, distance from the earthquake epicentre), structural (e.g., the type and availability of housing and other civic structures, earthquake impact) and economic dimensions (e.g., they represented a service town, a tourist town, a farming centre, a national park village) they were all facing challenges associated with new migrants and temporary population groups in the community. Broad – and often interconnected – challenges facing all four communities included: concerns around population levels; changing community demographics; employment issues (e.g., inability to meet demand for labour, lack of opportunity for locals); housing (e.g., shortages and lack of suitability of extant housing stock, earthquake damage, increased demand from new migrants and seasonal labour); economic development concerns and governance challenges.

A transient population continuum (based on time in the community) was used as a framework to understand community challenges associated with a wide range of newcomers (both from other parts of New Zealand and overseas). Population groups located across the transient continuum were found in the four communities with all four communities economically reliant on them as both consumers and producers. Four broad categories of transience, and their key demographic characteristics, were identified:

- *Permanent residents* (more than one year) and newcomers with either an intention of, or on a pathway to, permanent residence, broad range of migration purpose (e.g., economic migrants, family migration, retirees, refugee and asylum seekers), mixed age/mixed family status
- *Semi-permanent residents* (between six months and one year) who were primarily labour migrants, many with repeat or habitual residence in the community, a significant proportion from overseas, mixed working ages/mixed family status
- *Temporary residents* (in the community for up to six months), short-term and seasonal labour (including working holidaymakers), service staff for businesses catering to transient populations described below, significant proportion from overseas, younger working ages/single
- *Transient populations* (less than two weeks), domestic and international tourists, people travelling for employment.

Length of time in the community (along with habitual or previous visitation patterns) was proposed as a key indicator of community integration, although the achievement of this was tempered by ethnic, cultural and language differences. These differences presented as significant challenges in communities with minimal prior history of immigration (e.g., the service town) with newcomer populations often challenging perceptions of community identity. Community identity was strongly associated with economic function with the two smallest communities in the study (i.e., the farming centre and national park village), in particular, challenged by demographic, social and governance changes which threatened this identity. While integration into the community was perceived as important primarily in respect of only those newcomers with intention to remain, some effort was made within all four communities to accommodate and welcome more temporary residents. From a resident population perspective, knowing who was present in the community, and understanding the economic demographic, social and cultural dynamics associated with different population groups, was identified as a key facet of successful migrant integration.

However, significant infrastructural and governance challenges – which impacted on community integration – were identified in all four communities. The availability of rental housing was impacted by ownership structure (e.g., the high percentage of holiday homes in the national park village precluded rental availability) and suitability of housing stocks for the rental market (e.g., a supply of family homes did not match demand from predominantly single semi-permanent and temporary workers in the service town). Housing supply for service workers was an ongoing challenge in the tourist town as a result of increasing demand for service workers in response to growth in visitor numbers. The isolated location of available housing (coupled with lack of transportation options) presented challenges for newcomers to the farming centre and impacted significantly on community integration. While the construction of purpose built worker

accommodation (by employer groups) in both the service town and the tourist town ameliorated these housing issues to some degree, they also fostered segregation in the community.

Governance challenges were associated with having a small population, a rural location (i.e., spatially distant from central, regional and local government) and lack of resources (e.g., in respect of social support organisations, human resources and funding). Employer-led organisations and employer-support provided a key connector between newcomers and the long-term resident community and an important community resource although this sometimes reduced the 'visibility' of those newcomers within the wider community. The visibility of various newcomer (transient) groups was a function of both the host community's dependence (i.e., the importance of that group to the local economy or community) and the features of the newcomers themselves (including their ethnicity and language, demographic characteristics, purpose of visit or occupation, length of time in the community, etc).

Woods, M. (2018a). Precarious rural cosmopolitanism: Negotiating globalization, migration and diversity in Irish small towns. *Journal of Rural Studies,* 64:164-176. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jrurstud.2018.03.014

Rural cosmopolitanism conceptualised as an individual characteristic, as a property of communities and as a political or ethical project. Irish public and political discourse describes four types of immigrant (encouraged, tolerated, expedient and discouraged) (Gilmartin, 2015). '*Transversal enablers'* act as bridges between communities with their cosmopolitan competences informing the negotiation of difference in the towns. Many migrants led '*bifocal lives*' through ongoing remittance transfers, active financial investment in their home countries and regular (extended) periods of return. While technology facilitates the transversal of geographically distant societies (enabling access to the culturally familiar) it also mitigates against integration. However, integration does occur over time. Community events which encompass migrant groups help to normalise immigration and cultural diversity. Mobility of the Irish (both historically and current) also normalises experience of diversity.

The small size of rural towns (with interspersed homes) makes immigrant populations more 'visible and thus knowable'. Share a limited number of workplaces, shops and public facilities. Not necessarily an equal interchange, however – immigrants use many extant community services (although some social spaces are not used) while residents do not engage in the same way with migrant-owned ethnic food shops; religious fragmentation can also occur alongside distinct gendered differentiation within some immigrant ethnicities. Immigrant participation in community social activities is constrained by cost, working schedules and lack of transport, and is impacted by uncertainty around permanence in the community and accommodation limitations. Uncertainty mitigates against building relationships and community participation. Immigrants often more vulnerable because of their type of employment and a lack of access to family and community support networks.

While evidence of both individual and community cosmopolitanism were found in the case study communities this was shaped by local factors: lack of anonymity found in small communities; the shared use of singular spaces and services; absence of

residential segregation; common workplaces; and a sense of collective interest in sustaining the community. Cosmopolitanism was challenged or constrained by: the small size of the individual ethnic communities, including the limited nature or absence of support networks within or for these communities; restricted options for employment or consumption; and the visible otherness of ethnic minority residents.

Also see:
Gilmartin, M. (2015). *Ireland and Migration in the Twenty-first Century*. Manchester University Press: Manchester.

Woods, M. (2018b). Rural cosmopolitanism at the frontier? Chinese farmers and community relations in northern Queensland, c. 1890-1920. *Australian Geographer*, 49(1):107-131. https://doi.org/10.1080/00049182.2017.1327785

Paper in which Woods proposes that rural cosmopolitanism is not a recent development based on the analysis of documents relating to the Chinese population in rural Queensland at the turn of the century. The Chinese appeared to be more welcome than in other parts of Australia as they represented an important labour force (employed primarily in the agriculture sector) rather than being involved in gold mining, although there was evidence of ethnic conflict between the multiple groups present in the wider rural district and a strict racial hierarchy existed. Attitudes towards the Chinese population exemplified four broad positions: outright racism and hostility; pragmatic defence of the Chinese as vital to the economy; allusions to racial difference, but emphasising tolerance within the law and defending Chinese property-owners rights as rate-payers; and, unqualified acceptance of Chinese migrants. Woods suggest that evidence for the latter position can be found in accounts of social interactions which indicated friendship and acceptance between Chinese and European residents on a personal level.

Wulff, M. & Dharmalingam, A. (2008). Retaining skilled migrants in regional Australia: The role of social connectedness. *Journal of International Migration and Integration,* 9(2):147-160. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12134-008-0049-9

Evidence suggests that many migrants admitted to Australia under regional migration policy initiatives (requiring a minimum period of residence in regional areas) relocate to capital cities after their conditional location period ends. An empirical examination of the determinants of social connectedness (identified as an important factor in the retention of migrants in the community) in regional Australia. Literature suggests that duration of residence is a strong factor, along with socio-demographic characteristics (i.e., age and life cycle stage) and community level factors (e.g., civic structures such as local businesses, churches and social associations). Research proposed a social connectedness index, derived from responses to five questions about participation in various community activities. These were regular attendance at an activity arranged by: the local school; religious organisation; people from their home country; the local community or council; or participation in activities involving sports or hobbies. Children in the household was found to increase the likelihood of social connectedness (by 72%), followed by assistance provided by and employer sponsor upon arrival (increase by 70%), with length of residence and region of birth (linked to some degree to speaking

English as a first language) also having some impact. Tradespersons were found to be half as likely to have strong social connectedness compared to migrants with other occupations. Research respondents living in small towns (i.e., populations less than 10,000) had twice the social connectedness as those who lived in capital cities. Age, housing tenure and English as first language were found to have no impact on social connectedness.

Wulff, M., Carter, T., Vineberg, R. & Ward, S. (2008). Special issue: Attracting new arrivals to smaller cities and rural communities: Findings from Australia, Canada and New Zealand. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 9(2):119-124. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12134-008-0048-x

A special edition which examines regional migration policies designed to attract new arrivals to hinterlands or low-growth centres. Research focused on Australia, Canada and New Zealand, all of which have significant urban population concentrations. Beyond these, many regions and smaller centres have experienced population decline, population ageing and outmigration of young people and face labour shortages (of skilled workers, professionals, employees in the agricultural sector and seasonal workers). Provides an overview of factors that foster sustainable immigrant settlement:

- Programmes must be expeditious, flexible and provide a good match between skill supply and demand in respect of employment
- Most effective attraction and retention strategies are those developed through a partnership approach involving government, employers, community organisations and service agencies
- More likely to succeed if community-driven and incorporates immigrants as community builders and stakeholders
- Communities must be 'welcoming communities'
- Provide opportunities for immigrants and non-immigrants to interact with each other to create positive community relations and meaningful social inclusion.

5. Acknowledgements

We wish to acknowledge funding from the Building Better Homes, Towns and Cities National Science Challenge: Ko ngā wā kāinga hei whakamāhorahora.